

Book Reviews

PÁLSSON, Gísli *Coastal Economies, Cultural Accounts. Human Ecology and Icelandic Discourse*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1991. xviii + 202 pp., ill., bibliogr., index, ISBN 0-7190-3543-0, £ 35.00 (hardback).

This is a thought-provoking and stimulating book. Though elegantly concise, it contains an overwhelming amount of information and many interesting theoretical observations. In the first part of his book, Icelandic anthropologist Gísli Pálsson unfolds his analytical framework referring to the work of scores of social theorists in a critical manner. In the second part, he applies this framework to the ethnography of Icelandic fishing. Though the better part of his monograph has been previously published in a variety of scholarly journals and volumes, one may welcome this compilation.

In the first chapter the author delineates three models concerning the relationship of individuals and society: the private, the dualistic, and the constitutive model. The first sees human beings as self-contained rational individuals for whom group membership is optional; the second considers society as being outside the individual and the individual outside society; the third suggests that individuality and agency of human beings derive from their involvement in social relations. Pálsson opts for the last model, contending that it avoids reducing individuals to instruments and conflating social differences between production systems.

In the next chapter, he forcefully argues for a model of fishing in which the social forces of production are at the core. Too often, anthropologists have adopted a 'natural' model of fishing 'which depicts the individual producer as an autonomous isolate, engaged in the technical act of catching fish' (p. 23). This model further tends to distort or suppress the role of women in fishing economies. Pálsson proposes another approach which distinguishes the social differences in access to resources and circulation of products.

I agree with the purport of Pálsson's argument in this chapter on anthropological discussions of fishing economies (parts of which appeared in this journal under the title 'The Art of Fishing'; see *MAST* 1989, 2[1]:1-20). However, I regret that his review omits much of the more recent maritime anthropological literature. The 'social' models of fishing Pálsson so eagerly propagates are not entirely absent. For instance, the debate on common property resources has not only yielded new ethnographic insights, but has also been important in theory and model building. Matters like modes of access and their distributive consequences are central to this debate. What is more, in his model the author confines himself to discussing access and circulation; why not explicitly include the other aspects of the social relations of production: control over the means of production and the division and organization of labor? This would render Pálsson's model – in which he distinguishes two modes of circulation (for use and for exchange) and two modes of access (without and with ownership) – more comprehensive.

Admittedly, Pálsson does state that his model is an idealtypical simplification. Its significance lies in the fact that it can help understand the construction, logic, and evolution of production systems and illustrate and account for cross-cultural differences, for example

regarding folk models of fishing. Chapter three deals with this subject and more generally with the relations among types of fishing economies and production discourses – 'the ways in which people represent fishing and fisheries to themselves and to others' (p. 54). The author explains that representations are constructed in action and that representations and practices are embedded in social production systems. Following his own model, Pálsson distinguishes four types of fishing societies. He examines how their members explain differential success and which notions of labor they have. With regard to production discourse, there may be (1) a folk model for differential success and personal differences among fishermen; (2) no folk model and no measurable differences; (3) no folk model but personal differences and (4) a model but no personal differences. These four logical possibilities are not distinguished for the sake of pigeon-holing. What is important is 'how different kinds of discourse are initiated and reproduced as authoritative systems' (p. 81) and this can only be understood in terms of social life and history.

Pálsson applies this theoretical perspective to the ethnography of Icelandic fishing. He deals with three distinct periods in three separate chapters: the phase of peasant or household production from roughly the ninth to the late nineteenth century (chapter four), the phase of the expanding market economy during the first half of the twentieth century (chapter five), and the phase of consolidated capitalism and state intervention in recent decades (chapter six). Each transformation in the production system was accomplished by a change in the Icelandic fishermen's discursive models or representations of nature and production.

During peasant production, there was a natural ceiling on production due to technical and social constraints and in the folk model fishermen were seen as passive recipients of fish. Relations aboard boats were egalitarian, success or failure of catches was not attributed to anyone personally. A series of anomalous water-beings mediated between the sea and the land, between nature and society. The focus of production discourse was on nature, viewing fishing as a struggle against the elements.

This representation changed when peasant fishing gave way to capitalist fishing in the era of market expansion. The 'natural' ceiling on production ceased to exist, labor became a commodity, and a competitive production discourse arose in which differential success was attributed to personal differences among skippers with a concomitant competition for prestige, capital, and labor. The labor process became gender-specific; only the work of men was regarded as productive. The mythology of water-beings became redundant and fish were no longer perceived as gifts but regarded as being subject to human control. In short, the focus of production discourse shifted to society, seeing fishing essentially as a competition among fishermen.

During the phase of consolidated capitalism overfishing caused resource problems, the state intervened and bureaucrats increasingly based their policies on data gathered by marine biologists. This led to a "scientific" discourse on production and resource use... and with it emerged a new rationality which assumes that humans are collectively responsible for the maintenance of fish' (p. 133). A ceiling on production was imposed through a quota system. Production discourse became centered on both ecological and social relations, in that human beings are seen to depend on fish and fish on human beings. The new rationality challenges the wisdom of fishermen and is beginning to make their folk model of production redundant. Since the introduction of quotas, the discourse on differential success and its causes has lost its importance, capital is concentrated in fewer hands, and it is very difficult for newcomers to enter the fishing industry. As Pálsson rightly observes: 'Apparently neutral and technical

management decisions have had important effects on the balance of power and structure of the fishing industry by changing the possibilities and alternatives with respect to access to fish' (p. 138). It should be understood, however, that 'scientific' models are as much social constructions as folk models.

In the last chapter, Pålsson returns to some of the broader theoretical issues raised earlier, reiterating some of his major points in a comparative perspective. In a programmatic fashion, he states that 'rather than elaborate on the unique and the idiosyncratic, the apparently boundless variety in ethnography, anthropological analysis should strive to establish both the contrasts and the parallels in production discourse and to look for explanations for such contrasts and parallels' (p. 160). Moreover, he makes a point stressing that human agency and purpose should be reintroduced in social theory. I can highly recommend Pålsson's own ambitious book to those wishing to embark on that course. Though one may of course squabble over some matters of detail, he presents a cogent argument and his analysis is replete with observations deserving further research.

Rob van Ginkel
University of Amsterdam

HOLM, Poul *Kystfolk. Kontakter og sammenhaenge over Kattegat og Skagerak ca. 1550-1914*. Esbjerg: Fiskeri- og Søfartsmuseet – Saltvandsakvariet, 1991. 348 pp., ill., English summary, ISBN 87-87453-525.

Since the 1950s and 1960s Scandinavian maritime cultural research has been enriched with various publications, representing different theoretical views and perspectives. Thus this book is built upon a solid foundation of decades of scholarly knowledge. The book is a result of a collaboration between several universities, museums and archives in Norway, Denmark and Sweden involved in the *Skagerak-Kattegat project* which has yielded a number of publications.

The waters of Kattegat and Skagerak, besides being a Nordic lake, connect the Baltic sea with the North Sea, providing excellent opportunities for close contact between the coastal settlements. The aim of Holm's book is to take a closer look at how, during the period 1550-1914, people along the shores of Denmark, Southern Norway, South- and West Sweden have used the resources of the sea and how they created a way of life adapted to the maritime conditions. During this long period the region experienced several economic as well as political changes. Politics and economies were often intertwined, as the geography of the region rendered it an extremely strategic passage to the Baltic Sea. Holm's aim is to investigate the livelihood of the inhabitants without regard to changing national boundaries.

The main aspect of Holm's view is that he rejects the idea of the Skagerak-Kattegat region as a historically cultural whole, split apart by the consequences of capitalism and modernization. Instead he shows us the vast cultural differences of the region in a historical perspective. In this respect the book is a success. Holm convinces the reader of the complexity of the region, and how differently various coastal habitats have adapted to political, economic, ecological and technological changes during the period. But to reach this conclusion which in itself can hardly be regarded as revolutionary or innovative, Poul Holm presents such detailed empirical descriptions that he seems to lose sight of the overall objective. The elaborate descriptions leave only limited room for a general theoretical analysis. This is

probably due to the deep historical scope. This forces Holm to use different sources which require very different methodological angles. Besides the general problems of addressing such a long time period, the region discussed includes the coasts of three countries, Denmark, Sweden and Norway, which at times makes it confusing for the reader as to where he is. These objections are very much related to the structure of the book and the magnitude of the author's project.

Poul Holm touches upon topics which have been studied by several scholars. This becomes especially significant in the last chapters of the book, beginning with a discussion of the mentalities of the changing maritime cultures. The author engages in a critical discussion of the idea of the 'democratic' Scandinavian maritime society mainly present in the works of Olof Hasslöf (1949) and, to a lesser extent, Orvar Löfgren (1977). But today this discussion seems redundant as the flaws of, for instance, Löfgren's transactional perspective were already clearly pointed out in the late 1970s (Kildegård-Hansen 1979). The critique becomes all the more 'out of date' as Holm does not discuss perhaps the most significant and pioneering study of maritime culture and economies in Scandinavia, Thomas Höjrup's discussion of life modes among Danish fishermen (Højrup 1983).

This is a serious objection, as a comment on Höjrups' reasoning could have opened up a more mature theoretical discussion, which is generally lacking in the book. Well aware of several differences regarding politics, economies and structure and organization of the fisheries, the book would have benefited from a general discussion of maritime conditions of the North Atlantic.

Despite the flaws which I have pointed out, Poul Holm's book provides a solid description of the cultural and economic complexity of the Skagerak-Kattegat region over a period of four hundred years. It is rich with examples and vivid descriptions and one gets a convincing picture of coastal people struggling to cope with hazardous environments to make their living by fishing and seafaring. As I see it the strength of this book is its summarizing discussion of Scandinavian maritime cultural and historical research. As such I warmly recommend the book.

Finnur Magnusson
University of Lund Sweden

References Cited

- Hasslöf, Olof
1949 *Svenska västkustfiskarna. Studier i en yrkesgrupps näringsliv och sociala kultur*. Göteborg.
- Højrup, Thomas
1983 *Det glemte folk. Livsformer og centradirigering*. Copenhagen.
- Kildegård-Hansen, Bjarne (Ed.)
1979 *Det forsømte tiår. Etnologi og folkloristik siden '68. Nord-Nytt. Nordisk tidskrift for folkelivs-forskning* 4.
- Löfgren, Orvar
1977 *Fångstmän i industrisamhället. En halländsk kustbygds omvandling 1800-1970*. Lund.

GINKEL, Rob van *Tussen Scylla en Charybdis. Een Etnohistorie van Texels Vissersvolk (1813-1932)*. Amsterdam: Het Spinhuis, 1993. 348 pp., ill., bibliogr., ISBN 90-73-052-696.

It has often been noted: fishermen sail a narrow course, their fortunes depending on the vagaries of nature as well as on the whim of market forces. Van Ginkel titled his book *Between Scylla and Charybdis*, applying the classical imagery of sea monsters and whirlpools to the parameters affecting the lives of the fishermen of Texel, a small island along the north coast of the Netherlands. Van Ginkel studied two contrasting fishing communities on this island, focusing on the period 1813 to 1932. Combining anthropological fieldwork with archival research, his book provides a special understanding of long-term developments in the relationship between fishermen and their natural environment.

1813 was the year in which Napoleonic rule over the Netherlands terminated, bringing a period of isolation to an end. Interestingly, Texel had been heavily involved in international affairs in the eighteenth century: the oyster fishermen of the village of Oosterend sold their produce on the markets of Hamburg and Amsterdam, and the population of Oudeschild provided piloting services to the fleet of the Dutch East India Company which anchored off the coast of Texel. Both activities suffered during the French occupation; whereas oyster fisheries recovered upon their departure, the men of Oudeschild were forced to try their luck in coastal fishing.

In the course of the next 120 years, Texel fishermen demonstrated a remarkable capacity to adapt to changing circumstances. When oyster fisheries finally collapsed around 1850, eelgrass harvesting (for the mattress industry) and shell quarrying (for the construction industry) grew and brought with them specific sets of production relations. And when opportunities in these sectors worsened, the Oudeschild fishermen went into prawn fishing and processing, whereas Oosterend fishermen invested in deep-sea fishing. The boom which took place during the last quarter of the nineteenth century caused boat builders (instead of merchants) to extend ample credit to enterprising fishermen, leading to growth of the fishing fleet. By the turn of the century, however, fisheries slipped into a decline which lasted basically until 1932, the year in which the dam sealing off the *Zuiderzee* and changing the marine ecology of the entire region was completed.

The first chapters of *Between Scylla and Charybdis* provide an overview of developments in the fields of demography, politics, infrastructure and fishing technology during the research period and the period preceding it. Van Ginkel emphasizes that the evolution of Texel fisheries was closely linked to broader developments such as the increasing strength of the Dutch national state. Three topics figure prominently in subsequent chapters: the strategies fishermen employ in the face of changes in market or ecology; fishermen's organizations and the conditions under which they arise; and the validity of Hardin's theory of the 'tragedy of the commons'. For reasons of brevity only the last issue will be considered here.

Van Ginkel provides two detailed examples of sea tenure on Texel: in oyster fisheries and in the harvesting of eelgrass. Both activities were of considerable economic importance and witnessed a long boom period, followed by decline. On the face of it, developments in Texel oyster fisheries confirm the tragedy of the commons theory: the commonly owned oyster beds became overexploited, leading to a steady drop in catches and ultimately – when the market also collapsed – to the demise of the whole industry. But Van Ginkel makes two important qualifications. First, overexploitation 'had nothing to do with an innate predatory mentality

but with the fact that fishermen were threatened in their livelihood.... They had to try to survive from week to week, and initially chose to intensify their efforts' (p. 77). Second, the behaviour of Texel oyster fishermen can only be understood in the context of specific infrastructural, technological and socio-economic developments in that same period: the invention and dissemination of steam engines, the opening of new markets and the increase in consumer purchasing power, and the introduction of more efficient harvesting methods. Hardin's theory, Van Ginkel warns, must be contextualized and does not have a universal value.

Developments in the eelgrass industry provide an interesting contrast. From its inception around 1845, this Texel industry was highly regulated. Van Ginkel distinguishes four types of tenure: open access, private property, communal property, and state-owned grounds. The regulation of the industry was not caused by the danger of overexploitation, however, but by a desire to gain control over market prices. Overexploitation was not likely to occur in this sector due to the specific characteristics of the product; the eventual decline of the industry was caused by reduced demand in the mattress industry and not by a deterioration of the resource base.

State intervention and privatization are regularly brought forward as solutions for tragedies of the commons, and Van Ginkel's historical material on Texel gives us a glimpse of their value. His analysis of the eelgrass industry illustrates, for example, that state intervention can be motivated more by the desire to generate revenues than to protect the resource. And while his material in my opinion does not allow for conclusions as to the significance of privatization for resource conservation, it does demonstrate the price tag which may be attached: pauperization of a large segment of the population and a sharp distinction between the haves and have-nots.

Unfortunately, at least for those who are eager to draw lessons from history, Van Ginkel does not venture policy conclusions with regard to the effectiveness of forms of sea tenure. The off-hand remark (p. 115) that 'the combination of access regimes is more effective than one single regime' tickles the reader's curiosity, however, and begs further elaboration.

Van Ginkel's book contains a wealth of original material on the character of and changes in Texel fisheries between 1813 and 1932 and on the people who effected and were affected by them. Although it deals with an earlier period, the issues at stake still strike the reader as contemporary. The book would gain in clarity if time periods were indicated more consistently and a chapter containing an overview of developments in the period was added. As it is, one is sometimes left wondering how the pieces fit into the puzzle. However, the book's main limitation is that it is written in Dutch. One wishes an English language version were available.

Maarten Bavinck
University of Amsterdam

DURRENBERGER, E. Paul *It's All Politics: South Alabama's Seafood Industry*. Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1992. xvi + 216 pp., tables, figures, references cited. ISBN 0-252-01910-5.

Paul Durrenberger's new book is not only an important contribution to understanding the historical and political processes that shape the course of fisheries, it is also a readable and detailed history of Alabama's Gulf-coast fisheries, from ante-bellum times through the present. Here is a history of a major fishery which is so rich in its details that it prompts us to

reflect upon the limitations of synchronic studies when it comes to understanding fisheries dynamics. Durrenberger shows how Alabama's coastal fisheries and the communities articulated with them are not phenomena which are situated in certain spaces over long periods of time, or which have grown and changed in a more or less predictable fashion while retaining important continuities. Rather, he shows them to be richly variegated phenomena which can change kaleidoscopically, and which sometimes change so radically that altogether new systems of organization and activities emerge.

Durrenberger describes three major eras of development in Alabama's seafood industry: first, fishing for local and regional commerce, from roughly 1819 through 1915, a period when seafood was preserved with ice and during which rail transportation networks and ice production expanded, increasing the market for seafood – with dynamic consequences for local producers; second, industrial canning, from roughly 1915 through 1950; which eventually fostered conditions favorable for the third major era, industrial shrimping and freezing, beginning around 1950 and continuing through the present. 'In each of the three periods' he writes, 'we see the interaction of different elements... Each period is a different system with interdependent parts. As one changes, the others change until the whole system changes and a new period starts.'

One might be tempted to therefore appraise the book as a neat blending of history, economics, and political and policy science, but otherwise not regard it as particularly anthropological, since the author's emphasis throughout is the political-economic history of Alabama's coastal fisheries and seafoods industries. To the contrary, the book *is* anthropological because of its unwavering focus on the human actors involved with these fisheries, their feelings, desires, and motivations. Commenting on his not having taken the usual ethnographic approach, which might have instead focused on a single community and tracked it through time, the author says this 'widens our view but sacrifices the intimacy and detail of participant observation.'

Thus he has given us an intimacy with actual history – its multiplicity of differentially motivated and empowered actors, its surprise turns, its sometimes paradoxical outcomes. Perhaps not since the publication of McEvoy's (1986) detailed history of California's fisheries have we seen so thorough a history of a major fishing region. Indeed, I feel this book ranks with McEvoy's superb work as a similarly outstanding study of a major fishing region and its problems, but which is even more humanistic and anthropological.

Durrenberger's main sources were newspapers, especially the *Mobile Register*. Secondly, he relied on other published accounts, fishery statistics, and so forth. He also obviously conducted extensive field work in coastal Alabama.

In the book's final two chapters the author discusses the inappropriately great influence which scientific discourse now exerts on fisheries policies. 'Since science has become the foundation of (modern) policy,' he writes, 'science itself has become political.' Fishers, he notes, have not often availed themselves of science for fighting back against those who are using it against their best interests. Here he is perhaps overly cynical when he concludes that 'scientific expertise can be aligned with either side of a contest; a plausible scientific rhetoric can be constructed for any position,' and similarly where he states that 'When "science" becomes a form of rhetoric in the service of policy, it no longer has the status of a way of knowing things. It becomes, rather, a political weapon in the hands of those powerful enough to afford it.'

His two concluding chapters also explore other commonplace problems which are besetting so many fisheries these days; and show how policies for fisheries are increasingly being influenced by events occurring in other contexts which seem remote from the fisheries. Commenting on this, he says that 'Often the fishing industry is not the central concern of the policy, as with imports, environmental quality, and endangered species.'

In the book's last chapter Durrenberger argues that anthropologists can make a great contribution to understanding the political dynamics influencing fisheries policies, since 'matters of allocation and distribution effects, political issues, are often what anthropologists are most competent to talk about.' Such concerns, he says, are 'part of our subject matter, part of the data we try to understand, while it is not part of the subject matter of biologists.' Fisheries administrators, he notes, most of whom had their formal training in the biological sciences, have continued to focus on biological or conservationist issues because they cannot give much recognition to an obvious fact: that each regulation, regardless of its biological or conservationist impact, will benefit some people while bringing about a loss for others.

As a political-economic history of a major fishery, and for its concluding discussion exploring the complex dynamics underlying fisheries-management policies, this book is a tour de force. On the other hand, some readers may find the considerable historical detail in the book's main body tedious to get through. Overall, congratulations are in order for both author and press.

James R. McGoodwin
University of Colorado-Boulder

References Cited

McEvoy, Arthur F.

1986 *The Fisherman's Problem: Ecology and Law in the California Fisheries, 1850-1980*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

POLLNAC, R.B., C. BAILEY and A. POERNOMO (Eds.) *Contributions to Fishery Development Policy in Indonesia*. Jakarta: The Central Research Institute for Fisheries (CRIFI), 1992. 169 pages, ISBN 979-8186-19-2.

In his ethnography *Malay Fishermen* Raymond Firth offers a detailed cross-section of the economy of one part of the South-East Asian region, without at all mentioning the subject of biological carrying capacity. The fact that prominent contemporary maritime anthropologists deem the status of the resource now to be 'the most basic issue to be considered in the formulation of fisheries policy' (p. 1) is indicative of changed times. The contributions to this volume on fisheries policy in Indonesia invariably highlight the biological underpinnings of the economic system.

It is a heterogeneous volume, both in terms of quality and subject matter. Published by the Central Research Institute for Fisheries in Jakarta, the book contains eight papers on topics such as tuna resources potential in Indonesian waters, the role of women, the success of fishermen's cooperatives, and the development of fisheries in various parts of the country. The most interesting contributions describe what has happened in several sectors (riverine, reservoir and coastal fisheries and aquaculture) since the Indonesian government (uniquely) announced a trawler ban in 1983.¹

Conner Bailey, in his paper on coastal aquaculture development, observes a clear link between the trawling ban and the large increase in acreage and productivity of brackish water ponds in Java. He describes a dualist economy in which large investors occupy a more and more prominent role to the exclusion of small traditional producers. However, the intensification of aquaculture has an interesting side effect: employment and pay levels increase significantly in comparison with traditional units. Intensification also bears a substantial risk of total collapse, and the author pleads for a shift from intensive to semi-intensive systems with a lower incidence of disease and pollution. Interestingly, he considers associations of shrimp producers, exporters and feed mill owners to be able to play an important role in this change-over, as they collectively benefit from a sustainable form of shrimp production.

Charles Zerner discusses the development of small-scale freshwater cage culture fishery in newly constructed reservoirs in Java. Meant generally for local persons who were displaced by the inundation of their land, it appears that outside investors have gained a strong grip on this fishery, employing local people only as labourers. Jurisdictional overlaps and general environmental oversight has resulted in serious overcrowding of cages and incidence of fish kills.

The development and management of riverine fisheries resources in Kalimantan and Sumatra is reviewed by Richard Pollnac and Stephen Malvestuto. It appears that traditional management systems are prevalent and effective in fisheries along the Kapuas River in Kalimantan, but wholly absent along the Musi River in Sumatra, where the government rents out access to the highest bidder. The authors do not explain the absence of a traditional management system in the latter location, but it may be speculated – following the argument of Bailey and Zerner with regard to the Moluccan Islands – that the lack of recognition of traditional management regimes by the government has contributed to their breakdown.

This brings us to a central theme in this book: the plea for development which is not only ecologically sustainable but also beneficial to the poorer members of traditional fishing communities. Decentralization of government decision-making and increased community management are argued to be essential elements in such an approach. The pressures against such a development are strong, however.

The incursion of private investors following the lure of profit from the (international) market is one issue. An interesting question in this regard is whether the trawling ban in Indonesia has caused the redirection of capital to other areas and other kinds of fishing, hereby shifting the very problem it was meant to solve. This does seem to have occurred in aquaculture in Java as described by Bailey; the other authors do not comment on the cause of large outsider investments in the sectors under consideration.

Another constraint is that the Indonesian government, despite the fact that its 'ability to effectively manage the nation's far-flung and extraordinarily diverse fisheries resources is extremely limited' (p. 51), is reluctant to recognize and convey authority to local level institutions which might be more efficacious. As the fear for decentralization in Indonesia is not limited to fisheries alone (a fact which is not touched upon in this volume), a change of approach does not appear to be realistic in the short-run.

Being policy-oriented, the book does not question government intent. At several points however, authors note that government action has actively contributed to the degeneration of fisheries potential and the effectiveness of local management institutions. Bailey and Zerner provide the clearest example, demonstrating that the rapid depletion of trochus resources in

the Moluccan Islands is partly due to government encroachment on an effective traditional management system.

The papers collected in this volume, uneven as they are, form a step in the documentation of the variation of fisheries development in South-East Asia. Not pretending to provide a complete overview of the subject, they demonstrate the fruitfulness – and sometimes the ungainliness as well – of interdisciplinary cooperation, such as takes place in the Central Research Institute for Fisheries (CRIFI) in Jakarta.

Maarten Bavinck
University of Amsterdam

Note

1. The paper by Bailey and Zerner was published earlier in *MAST* 5(1) 1992 under the title 'Community-based Fisheries Management Institutions in Indonesia,' and will receive only cursory attention here.

DIEGUES, Antonio C.S. (Ed.) *Tradition and Social Change in the Coastal Communities of Brazil: A Reader of Maritime Anthropology*. São Paulo: University of São Paulo, 1992. 207 pp.

Diegues leads off with a paper describing the main problems Brazilian researchers have to face to understand changes artisanal fishermen and their communities in Brazil are going through. He points to the disorganization caused by polluting industries, degradation of the environment, real estate development, forest exploitation, and the expansion of tourism and suggests that development programs benefit large entrepreneurial interests rather than small-scale fishermen because low productivity is not necessarily a problem, the programs fishermen did not control, and the social and cultural contexts and power systems in the fishing communities have not been taken into account. Social science should help the small-scale producers.

Beck discusses how people of Santa-Catarine Isle have been forced into artisanal fishing by deprivation of other alternatives; how the sea fishery supports the beach fishery by the wages it pays fishermen who invest in the shore fishery. She indicates that the diversities of artisanal fishing make generalization impossible and demand detailed study to understand how they are responding to the expansion of industry, real estate development, and tourism. Tânia Elias Magno da Silva discusses small-scale producers who, though they produce for markets, fail to accumulate capital as their income is used for the maintenance of the domestic group and replacement of their fishing gear. Small-scale producers are subordinated to capitalist production indirectly through monopoly of markets and destruction of stocks, and the history of small-scale producers is conditioned by the development of capitalist production. Small-scale production becomes disorganized and subordinate to capitalist production but does not disappear. Gláucia Oliveira da Silva presents a fascinating discussion of the conceptions of lagoon vs. sea and the analogic logic that links lagoon, women, menstrual blood, confinement, immobility, death, impurity versus the sea, men, unconfined, live, mobile, dynamic, and pure such that women can work in the lagoon but not at sea. Furtado discusses relations between household fishing and capitalist fishing and Mello points out that conflicts are not simply between artisanal fishermen and industrial fishing but among artisanal fishermen as state sponsored loans to a chosen few led to the development of markets and

fishing technological divisions within the artisanal sector. Hartmann discusses conflicts in inland waters between fishermen who want to direct production to larger markets and those who participate in more integrated locally centered subsistence centered systems and between fishermen and other claimants to water and shore resources such as real estate development, agriculture, cattle raising, mining, industry, and hydroelectric power. He calls for locally appropriate measures considered legitimate within fishing communities and intensive participation of communities and informal regulation. Martins sketches the share system, technology, and income of artisanal fishermen on the north coast of Maranhão. He says that the government departments responsible for technical assistance to artisanal fishermen do very little so any technological advances are a result of the fishermen's own experience; most people he talked to did not know of cooperative associations or government projects, and there is virtually total lack of municipal services such as water, electricity, sewers, transportation, medical assistance, and schools. Luiz Geraldo Silva outlines the history of fishermen's groups in northern and northeastern Brazil from 1966 to 1988. Branão discusses a project to prepare an ethnolinguistic atlas of fishermen in the state of Rio de Janeiro and Edila Vianna Silva describes an interdisciplinary project to study language and ethnography of fishing communities in the same state while Begossi discusses biological classification, especially of fish, in the Isle of Búzios. She shows that fishermen know their areas and the species they fish and concludes that projects should center on fisherman participation. Siqueira describes the life and problems of shore dwellers and fishermen on the north coast of São Paulo since its integration into the rest of Brazil via roads and television while Rodrigues, Oriando, and Ruano da Silva discuss fishing in the estuarine area of Lago Dos Patos to show that contradictions accumulated in the artisanal fishery until they began to threaten its continued existence. Gláucia de Oliveira Silva discusses the totemic classification of living beings among fishermen of Piratininga in Rio De Janeiro. Diegues argues that coastal ecosystems in Brazil have not been common property or open access resources but were owned and controlled by the people who used them and only became common property when capitalist fishing expanded to include these areas, a process that was made possible by making the inhabitants of such areas legally and rhetorically invisible by laws and practices that favored industrial and entrepreneurial fishing so fishing managers could simply ignore those who preceded these developments. These populations have only become visible by repeated resistance. Conservationists share the industrialists view and contribute to the invisibility of fishermen and 'ill-conceived conservation, like uncontrolled "development," can be a pathway to increasing marginality of local coastal populations' (p. 187) as conservationists move to create national parks and ecological reserves in coastal reserves, mangrove swamps, coral reefs, and island areas. He goes on to describe some local systems of sea tenure and conservation practiced by local fishermen.

All in all, this book presents a vivid picture of the varied conditions, concepts, and practices of fishing in all of their complexity in modern Brazil and the problems facing artisanal fishing from the development of contradictions within the artisanal fishery itself as goals and objectives shift from household provisioning to market production, the problems with environmental degradation due to industry and tourism, and the problems of invisibility of powerless people in the face of those with privileged access to the machinery of law, government, and enforcement. Diegues is to be congratulated and thanked for bringing this body of work to the attention of the English-reading public and for pointing out the importance of these issues to discussions of development programs and fisheries management everywhere on the planet.

Given the degree of activity that this book indicates, hopefully, the international academic community can look forward to more work on Brazilian fisheries in the future. Two areas could be examined with profit. The first is the nature of household production, since it is a recurrent theme in this work, but remains untheorized as a system (cf. Durrenberger 1984). The second is to examine the Brazilian state itself and its role in fisheries management. What are its policies? How are they formulated? Whom do they benefit? Who controls the process. There are many suggestions in this book, but they do not coalesce into analysis of the phenomenon that would embrace the political process and its clients from industrialists to conservationists and detail the place of fishermen in the process.

E. Paul Durrenberger
University of Iowa

Reference Cited

Durrenberger, E. Paul

1984 *Chayanov, Peasants, and Economic Anthropology*. San Francisco. Academic Press.

TVEDTEN, I. and B. HERSOUG (Eds.) *Fishing for Development: Small-Scale Fisheries in Africa*. Uppsala. The Scandinavian Institute of African Studies, 1992. 227 pp.

This is a collection of ten papers invited for a conference on fisheries development in Africa which was arranged by the Scandinavian Institute of African Studies and the Norwegian College of Fisheries Science. This is an important work. Its importance transcends Scandinavia, Africa, and fisheries as it addresses much larger problems, problems to which all social scientists should attend.

In the introduction the editors point out that fishing is most important in the western and southern parts of Africa and least important in the east and north. Some of the constraints to development in marine and inland fishing include lack of technology and expertise, shortcomings with marketing and distribution, pricing and credit, storage and processing, difficulties with joint approaches, unevenly distributed and exploited resources, all of which complicate identification of areas for coordinated policies regarding possible over-exploitation. Reasons for considering artisanal fisheries include that development policies of the 1950s and 1960s aimed at industrial fishing have failed to such an extent to initiate new policies and that production costs of artisanal fisheries are low and they have disproportional effects on employment. Artisanal fisheries, however, are characteristically dependent on external markets for their gear and to sell their fish, and industrial fishing influences them in terms of its impact on the resource, the market, and competition for fishing areas. Artisanal fisheries are, however, variable and insecure in terms of both catches and income. The editors present a picture of a classical tragedy of the commons in which all participants increase effort to increase production resulting in resource depletion and the difficulties of cooperative management. Relations between fishermen and intermediaries is complex and interlocking. Artisanal fishing is usually combined with other sources of subsistence and income. This sector of the African fisheries has survived and developed more in spite of government efforts than because of them, and without external development aid, the industrial sector would probably never have developed. Artisanal fisheries do not receive a share of development aid proportional to their importance, for one reason, because, requiring only small sums of money

but extensive administrative work, they fit only badly the mold aid organizations prefer. Thus there is conflict between industrial and artisanal sectors for resources, credit, markets, and institutional support. The book addresses itself to these issues and to questions of relationships between industrial and artisanal fishing, directions for development, and research priorities. 'We still know more about the different species of fish in African waters than we know about African artisanal fishermen, both in terms of quantity, migrations, and internal dynamics' (p. 25). They argue that Scandinavian researchers should have the freedom to work where fisheries are (rather than where their governments put development projects) to find out the characteristics of households and economic systems in which artisanal fisheries are important, the relations of fishing with other means of subsistence and income production, to understand relations among fishermen and middlemen, relations between modern and traditional components, whether popular participation is possible in development projects, the relevance of resource management models imported from other areas, and the nature of joint venture arrangements between African and Scandinavian countries. They underline the most important finding of the collected research as that artisanal fisheries are not remnants, doomed to extinction as modern fisheries expand. Rather, more than 90% of fishermen are artisanal and provide about 65% of the domestic catch.

Hersoug shows the inherent contradictions between realities of fishing and development projects. The ideas about how fisheries projects should be organized are impossible to practice in aid agencies because they opt for control and safety. Administrative procedures of agencies act against the practice of participation and favor top-down 'blueprint' approaches; goals are not decided but evolve in practice so expensive planning is largely irrelevant; different groups have their own political agendas and administration is not politically neutral. Local institution building is sacrificed in favor of some concept of efficiency of operation. In terms of fishing, as a process, fishermen do not follow neoclassical theory because they have neither perfect information nor freedom of choice, so they do not always abandon the fishery when they 'should.' The administrative process allocates differential power to different groups, thus constraining future choices. Project goals may be mutually exclusive or contradictory. Add to this that there is great uncertainty about theoretical optima in fishing so that efforts to increase catch capacity may result in resource depletion and reduced income. This is a lucid discussion of the problems of development, a problem that warrants further attention since most economic and fishery management theories take place in fictitious vacuums which disappear in practice sometimes to the puzzlement of the theoreticians. The implicit message is for the development of more participatory practice oriented local projects rather than highly administered theory driven centralized ones.

These points are underscored by Skjøsberg's paper which shows that the only vacuum in fisheries projects in northern Zambia was the vacuum of relevant analysis and information. From a total of 55 titles she found relevant to the area, only one had any sociological data or analysis, and that was scanty. 'The main emphasis among fisheries planners on biology and technology (fish resources and gears) may account for the many failed fisheries development interventions of the Northern Province,' she says laconically. This is certainly true of the United States as a whole, and this essay makes it clear that this lack is more widespread. She argues the point, obvious to any anthropologist, that the first stage in any project should be to understand the complexities of the existing fishing system, how the parts relate to each other, and how they define conditions for choice for the people in them. In other words, to find out the realities instead of assuming that all things are equal. Basic to such analyses

should be the cost-benefits, money flows, and strategic choices of fishermen and others in the system.

Lindqvist and Möslä return to the general theme that all things are not equal in their essay on whether management of small-scale fisheries is possible. They outline some common features of African artisanal fisheries and point to the variability to suggest that adaptive management would be most suitable to operate in terms of real social, economic, and cultural systems rather than relying on fisheries and economic models that get caught up in the contradictions of everyday reality in practice.

Degnol concludes the book with a paper that continues the same theme: development and aid agents are committed to a model of fisheries management based on northern European experience and projected onto a tropical artisanal fishery where it is often inapplicable because ecological, economic, institutional, and cultural variables are quite different so that, for instance, the assumptions of 'tragedy of the commons' are not universally appropriate. Even complexifications of basic fisheries models rely on external interference to maximize something outside agents want to maximize. Not only the approach but also the objectives are alien to the local community. The means are government agencies, restrictions, control, and prosecution rather than support and cooperation. He argues that in some cases the most important assistance to the artisanal sector would be discontinuing harmful interference. The first step to appropriate management is for managers and developers to convince themselves that artisanal fishermen understand their condition, the dynamics of the resources they depend on, and that they are innovative and adaptive socially, technologically, and in terms of management.

All of these papers, one way or another hint at a problem that none addresses directly. If a social process, such as development programs from Scandinavia aimed at artisanal or industrial fisheries in Africa continues, then it must be doing something for someone. This is especially obvious if the programs have goals they repeatedly fail to achieve. This suggests the announced goals are not the real goals of the programs. What is needed is an analysis that is bold enough to back up and ask for whom these programs are working? Who benefits from them? Clearly the entrenched development program and international aid community bureaucrats benefit. They make their livings from promoting such programs. Fisheries managers benefit. They make their livings from such ill-informed programs not only in Africa, Asia, Northern Europe, but also in the United States and Canada which face the same problems of inappropriate and failed management at national, international, and local levels. If the programs work for these people, then they work. What is at stake is not a fishery here or there in Africa, but jobs for fisheries biologists, economists, and international aid bureaucrats. A new generation of analyses needs to address the questions in this broader perspective. It is not, as Skjøsberg (p. 160) suggests that social scientists have neglected their duty to present findings that are accessible to development planners and administrators. Such findings, on the evidence of this book, these workers, and their bibliographies, is widely available to all who care to read them. The problem is not that social scientists do not speak the 'language' of bureaucracy. We all know that language all too well. The problem is that there are powerful national and international systems of management and programs with their own dynamics, politics, constituencies, economics, cultures and networks of backwards and forwards linkages (e.g. universities to train the managers who provide students for the university programs, etc.) not unlike those described for artisanal fisheries in this book. The problem is that those systems make rational analyses, such as these, largely irrelevant, as many of these studies

intimate in one way or another. If there is an answer, it may well lie in analysis at a higher level of socio-cultural integration, the level of the national and international agencies rather than the village. We know the outlines of the answers at the village level; if we do not know the answers, we know how to find them as this body of work shows, in detailed local analysis. We are less knowledgeable about the systems that contain us as producers and constrain us and make our work less effective than we would like it to be.

E. Paul Durrenberger
University of Iowa

HOONAARD, W.C. van den *Reluctant Pioneers: Constraints and Opportunities in an Icelandic Fishing Community*. New York: Peter Lang, 1992. xi + 173 pp., notes, graphs, bibliography, tables, ISBN 0-8204-1801-3.

Van den Hoonard centers his analysis of shrimping in a village in Iceland's West Fjords on the sociology of occupational groups established in other settings. The problems he addresses are both the internal and external dynamics of the occupational culture of these shrimpers. He situates the shrimpers in terms of the complexities of the Icelandic fishing industry with its trawlers, longliners, and jiggers, and shows how shrimping is a part of some fishing careers. He discusses how these shrimpers, like other occupational groups, distinguish between themselves and others, develop and maintain an occupational image, develop ideologies in support of their interests, and claim that their occupation promotes the general public interest.

In addition to placing the shrimpers among other fishermen, he situates them in terms of marine scientists from Iceland's capital, who define the terms of fishing policy, and the politics of the bureaucrats and politicians who set details of fishing policy, as well as the claims of processors and other fishermen. He illustrates the gap between the practical knowledge of shrimpers and the abstract understandings of scientists and how these conflict, as well as how shrimpers, scientists, and politicians have negotiated policies to conserve shrimp via a quota system, if not always according to every participant's ideals.

The shrimpers were successful in making claims for their expertise, and in political maneuvering to get a quota system based on individual boats that allows each to catch the amount most 'natural' to it and allows the best skippers to float to the top of a hierarchy that shrimpers claim is based on skill. This fortifies the occupational image of shrimpers, presentation of which is essential to the way they deal with outsiders whether they be fellow community members, other fishermen, processors, biologists, or politicians.

While van den Hoonard does an admirable job of situating the shrimpers in the overall Icelandic context, some interesting issues remain unexplored. One is the shrimpers' contention that their hierarchy of success is based on knowledge and skill. From his other tables it would appear that van den Hoonard has sufficient data to test this notion by checking the relationships between experience and non-experience related variables with success. One wonders how important it could be when, for instance one learns that 'one of today's most highly reputed crews learned to fish for shrimp in one day' (p. 118). He presents the view from the top of this hierarchy more systematically than that from the bottom.

The objective of a scientific determination of maximum sustainable yield, van den Hoonard tells us, is optimistic, and the biological information becomes critical. Poor data weakens the position of biologists as their predictions are often incorrect. Meanwhile,

shrimpers withhold data from biologists. It might be interesting to entertain the idea that the biologists' objective is not only optimistic, but that it might be impossible, as several recent works in this journal have argued (Wilson and Kleban 1992; Smith 1991; Finlayson 1991) or misformulated (McGuire 1991). It would seem that this case is a good example of chaos theory in action as well as the particular sociology and politics of chaos that Smith and Wilson discuss.

While van den Hoonard discusses the centralizing tendencies of Iceland's fishery management, he discusses the process of 'going south,' what Americans might call lobbying or special interest politics, to bring pressure to bear on both scientists and politicians to achieve a desirable outcome. This would appear to be a very open political system when local delegations of shrimpers can have such an immediate political result as he documents. This has not been possible for shrimpers in the United States.

While these interesting issues remain taken for granted, no single monograph can address all questions, and van den Hoonard presents a complex historical and ethnographic case that will benefit all who are interested in fisheries policy, local politics, occupational groups, shrimpers, or Iceland.

E. Paul Durrenberger
University of Iowa

References Cited

- Finlayson, Chris
1991 Notes on Chaos in Fisheries Management by Estellie Smith. *MAST* 4(1):91-97.
- McGuire, Thomas R.
1991 Science and the Destruction of a Shrimp Fleet. *MAST* 4(1):32-55.
- Smith, M. Estellie
1991 Chaos in Fisheries Management. *MAST* 3(2):1-13.
- Wilson, James A. and Peter Kleban
1992 Practical Implications of Chaos in Fisheries: Ecologically Adapted Management. *MAST* 5(1):67-75.

Books Received

Dudley, Michael Kioni

1993 *A Hawaiian Nation I. Man, Gods, and Nature*. Waipahu: Na Kane O Ka Malo Press.

Fischer, Lewis R. (Ed.)

1992 *From Wheel House to Counting House: Essays in Maritime Business History in Honour of Professor Peter Neville Davies*. *Research in Maritime History* No. 2. St. John's, Newfoundland: International Maritime Economic History Association.

Fischer, Lewis R. and Walter Minchinton (Eds.)

1992 *People of the Northern Seas*. *Research in Maritime History* No. 3. St. John's, Newfoundland: International Maritime Economic History Association.

Harrison, Simon

1993 *The Mask of War: Violence, ritual and the self in Melanesia*. Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press.

Hoonard, Will C. van den

1992 *Reluctant Pioneers. Constraints and Opportunities in an Icelandic Fishing Community*. New York: Peter Lang Publishing Inc.

International

1992 *International Journal of Maritime History*. June 1992.

1992 *International Journal of Maritime History*. December 1992.

1993 *International Journal of Maritime History*. June 1993.

Sánchez-Fernández, J.O.

1992 *Ecología y estrategias sociales de los pescadores de Cudillero*. Madrid: Siglo XXI de España Editores, S.A.

Tijdschrift

1993 *Tijdschrift voor Zeegeschiedenis*. Jrg. 12(1).

1993 *Tijdschrift voor Zeegeschiedenis*. Jrg. 12(2).

Ville, Simon (Ed.)

1993 *Shipbuilding in the United Kingdom in the Nineteenth Century: A Regional Approach*. *Research in Maritime History* No. 4. St. John's, Newfoundland: International Maritime Economic History Association/Trustees of the national Museums and Galleries on Merseyside.